



Terrorism as a Colonial Product: A Critical Study of By The Sea

Dr. Zia Ullah¹, Fazal Ghufran², Dr. Wajid Hussain³

¹Department of English, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Sheringal , Upper Dir, KPK, Pakistan

²Department of English, Shangla University, Shangla, KPK, Pakistan

³Department of English, Muslim Youth University, Islamabad, Pakistan

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
<p>Keywords: Abdulrazak Gurnah, Autobiography, By The Sea, Colonialism, Criminality, Extremism, Post-Colonialism, Terrorism.</p> <p>Corresponding Author: Dr. Zia Ullah, Department of English, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Sheringal , Upper Dir, KPK, Pakistan Email: ziastella77@yahoo.com</p> <p>ORCID: https://orcid.org/0009-0002-5187-5459</p>	<p>This research, accordingly, focuses on identifying the autobiographical elements in Abdulrazak Gurnah's novel <i>By The Sea</i>. The study, furthermore, explores the impact of colonialism, showing how it has contributed to the rise of terrorism and extremism. The research aims to demonstrate how these global issues are shaped by the actions and influences of powerful groups and how the behaviors of the colonized, often forced upon them, lead to criminality. Moreover, the research uses a close reading technique to analyze the text, paying particular attention to the characters who reflect the author's own experiences. This analysis is conducted within the framework of post-colonialism, which provides the theoretical basis for understanding the novel's themes. The study is grounded in post-colonial theory, which incidentally examines the lingering effects of colonialism on societies and individuals. Indeed, this theory helps to explain how the author's personal experiences and the broader consequences of colonialism are reflected in the novel. The analysis reveals that the novel <i>By The Sea</i> deeply mirrors the personality and experiences of Abdulrazak Gurnah. Similarly, it also shows that terrorism and extremism can be seen as consequences of colonialism, with criminal behavior among the colonized emerging as a response to the actions of the colonizers. The research, therefore, concludes that <i>By The Sea</i> is not only a reflection of Gurnah's own life but also a commentary on the lasting effects of colonialism. Nonetheless, the study suggests that terrorism and extremism are direct results of colonial history and that criminality among the colonized is a reaction to their colonizers. This research, consequently, contributes to a deeper understanding of the autobiographical elements in Gurnah's work and the broader implications of colonialism in literature. It highlights the relevance of post-colonial theory in analyzing contemporary issues like terrorism and extremism. Next, future research could extend this analysis to other works by Gurnah or explore similar themes in the literature of other post-colonial authors, likewise examining the connections between personal experiences and the lasting impacts of colonialism.</p>

INTRODUCTION

Colonialism is the forceful subjugation of the powerless. It is based on the persuasion of interests to gratify their greed. It is not easy to understand aspects of colonialism but the core purpose of colonialism is the capitulation of natives. Moving ahead with colonialism, colonizers not only disturb the appearance but bring about changes in cultural scenarios. Colonizers treat the colonized as barbarous and animalistic and do not know anything but treat them according to their aims and goals.

Colonization has overwhelming impacts on the natives. First, they are shackled and put to torment and different kinds of cruelty. Then to suppress their consciousness they adopt way of epistemic violence. Epistemic violence is the act of proliferation of discourses against the colonized. In the discourses, there is targeted their identity and their history even stolen from their generation.

The direct effects of colonialism cannot be maintained for a longer time but it vanished with the passage of time and post-colonialism emerged as a reactionary movement to overthrow the supremacy of the colonized. This study has been carried out under the umbrella of post-colonialism and applied the concept of Spivak which can the subaltern speak. So, as a result, the research has come up with a novel interpretation that subaltern can speak colonial effects give more impetus to colonized and give birth to different global problems like terrorism and extremism.

Moreover, it is stated that terrorism and extremism are not a natural phenomenon. It is socially and culturally promoted. Gun environment, slavery, and cruelty molded the mentality of the colonized and they became global terrorists. Not only are a group of communities who are terrorizing the world but who brought about colonialism responsible for diminishing global peace. Supremacy is a threat to global peace.

Author Abdulrazak Gurnah has authored a book titled *By The Sea*. It initially appeared in the United States on June 11, 2001, and in the United Kingdom in May 2001, thanks to Bloomsbury Publishing. Gurnah's sixth book is this one. The Booker Prize longlist and Los Angeles shortlist both included *By The Sea*. Part of the story of *By The Sea* is told by a man named Saleh Omar who is trying to enter the UK using a fraudulent passport. [Omar also uses the alias "Rajab Shaaban Mahmud," which he borrows to use on a fraudulent passport. Latif Mahmud, the son of the genuine Rajab Shaaban Mahmud—a man who turns out to be a scoundrel—also contributes to the narration of the book in part. Mr. Latif Mahmud

Research Questions

- 1) How does Abdul Razak reflect on Africans as revengeful in the novel *By The Sea*?
- 2) How does the narrative represent Abdul Razak's autobiography in the novel *By The Sea*?

Research Objectives

- 1) To know the way Africans attempt to pay back to the colonizers in the novel *By the Sea*.
- 2) To find out the way the narrative is the reflector of the author.

Rational of the Study

The above objectives have found out how colonizers erect differences between them vs themselves and put the colonized in a wide range of tumult and disturbance. Rob their possessions and name them bad in discourses. In the same way, it has focused focus on how the character of Gurna is permeated.

Significance of the study

This study is significant in the sense that colonialism is the root of problems like terrorism, extremism, and the deterioration of global peace. Colonialism destroys the purity of the

colonized it creates revenge and criminality in the powerless. They were not criminals but they were made criminals. Criminality is exercised everywhere in the world which puts global peace at stake.

Delimitation

The novel has been explored through different angles like colonialism and post-colonialism but it has not been researched on the novel aspect that subalterns prove to be a threat to colonial power. Similarly, colonialism has long-lasting repercussions like the emergence of terrorism, etc.

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

This chapter deals with the related literature review concerning the concept of exoticism, subaltern, and colonialism. Colonialism is a forceful subjugation of the powerless. Taking their assets, and property considering them backward. Colonialists subvert the entire structure for their benefit. They spread discourses against the standing norms of the colonized. Their whole structure has deteriorated at different angles. They are kept suppressed, depressed, and deprived of their basic rights. The related literature review moves around the attempt being made by the colonized against colonizers.

According to Asher (2013), modern colonial and decoloniality is a modern project that tends to overthrow colonial power. Subalterns are the natives who are subjugated by colonizers for their interests. Colonialism does not stand for a long time and the time comes when colonizers get their bags and go away once they get satiated and their demands get fulfilled. In this article, the writer expresses his idea that speaking against colonial power is one of the difficult jobs but to some extent, they attempt to speak against them. This is an attempt towards decoloniality either in language or in actions.

In the view of Jahmada (2014) subaltern is a Latin word used for those individuals who were below the rank of lieutenant and the jargon was used in military domains but later on, it was shifted to post-colonial literature and used for men and women who were deprived of their basic rights and lifestyle. In the case of Indian coloniality, he goes on to say that the group of Indians that has been kept deprived of this all is called Dalits and their writing Dalit literature. As Dalits are kept away from the fundamental right to live, their writing is marked as a revolt against the social system, and the efforts to establish social justice. Arjun Dangle, an eminent Dalit writer and activist rightly points out.

Dalit literature is represented by revolt and negativism that show the movement for freedom against the colonizers. Differences and revolt are the main features of Dalit literature. The language, style, and showcasing of characters are quite different. To cut short the point of view of the writer it is stated that the colonized changed the social structure and norms of the society for their individual purposes.

Lan (2021) writes in his article that colonizers capture the colonized and bring about institutional changes in the domains and lifestyles of the colonized. His works center on the self-masculinity of whites. In his book, it is mentioned that subalterns are molded in such a way that can not speak. If they attempt to speak and voice for their rights they are not subalterns. There is no structure for subalterns. They can not go against the devised structure.

According to Creter (2006), colonial attempts create disturbance in the atmosphere of the native people. They disturb not only their appearance but try to get down even their material and non-material culture. In this respect, he argues regarding the view of Spivak that she has combined Marxist and deconstructive approaches and analysis that colonialists

create falls oppositions regarding colonized and introduce their consciousness in the aura. Spivak uses deconstruction as a method and highlights the nasty attitudes of colonizers toward the colonized. He goes on to say that the oppression put down on the colonized does not get diminished but it gives more momentum to the oppressed and raises them to the level of revenge.

In the views of Barry (2002), it is stated that colonial efforts try to install such elements which make blur the identity of the colonized. Colonization is succeeded by post-colonialism. It attempts to overthrow the universality of the literature introduced by the powerful. Colonialism is the act of capturing everything even if it is mentality or psychology. In response to the literature produced by colonizers launched a reactionary movement called post-colonialism.

Furthermore, it is said that the colonized tried to break the shackles of slavery and cut the roots of colonialism from the very depths. They struggle to go against the narrative created by them that literature is not fixed to an age, era, time, or aura but it is timeless and beyond regional, language, and social limitations. The point of view is here that all of the above discussion is about a reaction against the devised rules of the powerful. In the same way, it also be taken that everything is socially constructed.

Post-colonialism consists of various terminologies, one of them is essentialism which means that going for the essentiality of something or someone. It is also called the whatness of something. In the context of race, ethnicity, or culture, essentialism suggests the exercise of different groups deciding what is and is not a particular identity. As an attempt, essentialism struggles to look for differences within groups often to maintain the status quo or obtain power. Essentialist claims can be used by a colonizing power but also by the colonized as a way of resisting what is claimed about them. This review is to unveil the acts done by colonizers and the attitudes of the colonized. Haq (2022) claims that colonizers make an effort to quell the resistance of the weak class to further their interests. History has shown how the strong and majority have oppressed the weak and minority, and as a result, the latter class has been and continues to appear to be exploited in numerous ways. The majority of the territories were originally ruled by the West, which saw itself as superior and the colonized as inferior, other, subaltern, and oriental (Leitch, 2010). The colonized's political, economic, and command structures make this clear. The colonizer did not implement the system (the means of governing and educating the populace) he had in mind. British colonial authority saw extensive exploitation of the subcontinent's resources and social structure. Additionally, they engaged in abuse.

According to Valk (2003), the exotic is kept under pressure to reap rewards. They only further their interests. This particular form of racism keeps colonized people under control. Racism is an intricate, contradictory, historically rooted system of dominance and/or exclusion that results in socioeconomic disparity between the majority population and ethnic group. Ineke further explains racism as a form of social inequality in the Journal, where certain social groups are denied equal access to and power over both material and immaterial social resources. Ineke defines material as a resource for employment, the economy, and housing. Immaterial resources include things like access to social media, media, politics, the legal system, the educational system, and the welfare system. They also include things like knowledge, education, and information. The distinctions were made based on phenotypic (physical traits and look) variations as well as some internal, invisible factors that scientists in the 20th century referred to as "racial essence." In-eke described it

as a social construct that was established to structure people in a state of presumptive perpetual inequity.

Mahsud(2021) argues in his article that the British failed to control the colonized in the region of FATA and they hit them in such a way that they become resistive. To suppress their resistance they used epistemic violence. Epistemic violence means installing such rules and principles to hide the weakness of colonizers and show the colonized barbarous and animalistic. He continues by saying that the laws were constructed using a British self-made epistemology that was inaccurate in its portrayal of the populace. They had epistemology applied to them in every way to follow the big narrative; the grand narrative is a vast, abstract concept. The grand narrative provides historical proof of socio-cultural phenomena including racism, apartheid (South Africa's policy of institutionalized racial segregation), gender inequality, and epistemic violence. The story that gives authority and power legitimacy is called a narrative. Here, the British developed a sweeping anti-tribal narrative to support a set of legislation. The big story is discouraged by social constructionists, which weakens it from the ground up. It is a tool being utilized to colonize the populace.

In his research, Haq (2022) asserts that Indians are stereotyped as strange, inferior, and cruel. To take advantage of colonization interests and benefits, new nomenclature has been introduced. The colonized's epistemology serves as a reality that is on their side. The epistemology that was formerly used against them in the guise of law is what has led to the current tragic and depressing picture of the population and the inequities that women experience. This demonstrates how colonization uses epistemology to destroy a people's culture, history, norms, and traditions. The true distinctions between the colonizer and the colonized have been made by it.

Discourses, according to Ribnow (1991), are controlled by the wealthy. Experts create knowledge by getting to know people and learning about their thoughts. As a result, discourses and policies are developed to make it a reality. The word epistemology is derived from the Greek words *episteme*, which means knowledge and understanding, and *logia*, which means study of science. It is the research of information. Knowledge is created by experimentation and observation, and it serves as universal truth. However, it is untrue in reality. There is a close connection between knowledge and power, as Foucault noted in his study of the links between power and knowledge. Power generates knowledge, and knowledge generates power in a feedback loop.

Epistemic violence, according to Spivak (2010) in his book *Can the Subaltern Speak*, is a method through which the Western form of knowledge destroys the indigenous form of knowledge.

It involves imposing one system of thought, speech, or body of information upon another. The foregoing literature review sheds light on the effort of colonizers to suppress the colonized. The efficiency of colonizers is to rob the colonized. In light of the above literature review, there is a gap in the research that the colonized are suppressed but in one way or the other way they become resistive and there is an expectancy to overwhelm the colonizers.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Research technique describes a researcher's way of problem-solving. It is applied to the methods of conducting research in the social sciences. Our aims, interests, and assumptions are shaped by methodology (Taylor et al,2016). Knowledge and information are the cornerstones of all development in today's "information societies." Finding information on any unknown concept, phenomenon, or process is not difficult, but it is much more difficult to search through an unlimited pool of knowledge for scientifically sound knowledge. It is more crucial to preserve scientifically sound knowledge. Consequently, research technique is a method for acquiring scientific knowledge (Boncz,2015).

Research Paradigm

The term "paradigm" was first introduced by American philosopher Thomas Kuhn (1962) in his book *The Structure of Scientific Revolution*, where he argued that it is a philosophical style of thinking. The word has Greek roots that translate to "pattern." In educational research, the word paradigm is used to describe a researcher's viewpoint (Knipe,& Mackenzie 2006). A school of thought or method of thinking that interprets research findings is called a worldview. According to Lather (1986), that paradigm refers to the researcher's viewpoint on the world in which he lives. The paradigm serves as a prism through which the researcher views the world and aids in the development of an abstract belief about it. It allows the researcher to look at the world where he lives. The paradigm helps the researcher to develop an abstract belief about the world and acts as a prism through which the researcher looks at the world. Through it, the researcher examines the methodological aspects of his research and also finds the method for analyses of data.

Data collection

The researcher will use both primary data from Abdul Razak's novel and secondary data from other books, articles, and journals.

Theoretical Framework

For the examination of the information collected from the text, the researcher will employ post-colonialism as a theoretical framework. In Spivak's theory of post-colonialism, the subaltern voice can be utilized to highlight colonized peoples' resistance movements.

Research Method

The Close Reading Method was used by the researcher to interpret the data. It alludes to a close investigation of a text in great detail. It is frequently used in place of New Criticism. By applying this method, we will be able to closely examine modern criticism necessitates and close examination of specific words, phrases, sentences, literary devices, allusions, symbols, and tones (Bressler, 2003). Therefore, nothing should be skipped over while reading the material. According to Fisher and Frey, "The close reading method requires readers to engage deeply with the text, focusing on the intricacies of language and structure" (Fisher & Frey, 2012).

DATA ANALYSIS

This chapter deals with the analysis of the novel written by Abdulrazak Gurnah Tanzanian-born British novelist. This part of the research tends to highlight and dig out multiple themes by cutting the tissues of the text. This study has been conducted under the umbrella of post-colonialism. Post-colonialism is a reactionary movement against the setup of colonizers. Colonized are being suppressed but the suppression does not go away. It makes the natives resist and act like a spring that stores energy and tries to get revenge on the colonizers.

By The Sea is an Autobiographic Representation of the Author Abdulrazak Gurna

It is said that literature is the reflection of life or social document. In light of the foregoing statement, it is said that Abdulrazak has planted some of the characters in the novel which is the

representation of the life or autobiography of the author. The story of the novel unfolds when Salih And Latif meet at the English seaside. Taking the three terms “Salih” “Latif” and English Seaside. These words seem somewhat contrary in the sense that the writer installs two Muslim characters who had been part of colonization and they get together on the English seaside.

The writer has deliberately used the characters in such a mood that shows the reflection of the writer. The writer himself moved to the USA which is reflected in the text of the novel. Whereas the aftershocks of colonialism maintain for a longer period and make the whole atmosphere unstable and tumultuous. Looking at the themes of the novel it becomes clearer that the penetrated themes in the novel are stories of love, seduction, betrayal, and people who eagerly try to get stability and comfort. The forgoing themes are aptly applied to the characters and then best applied to the biography of the writer he was also having the same life story trying to go to the USA for stability.

Colonial Effects on Colonized

Colonialism is the act of subjugation of the powerless, it does not only captivate their assets, and resources but even their mentality. The captivating mentality of the colonized is the landmark of colonizers. If assets are gone less gone but if mentality is gone everything is gone. It contaminates the culture, language, and artifacts of the colonized. Under long-term subjugation thoughts of the colonized vanished.

Proliferation of Epistemology

Colonizers not only tortured the colonized physically but made them slaves they spread discourses to the powerless and made them in their own ways. Concerning the characters Salih and Latif who want to get stability in the USA. Binaries are installed in the atmosphere of colonized powerful and powerless, black and white, and many more. The proliferation of these concepts is meant to turn the powerless as they want. Abdulrazak Gurna himself was affected by the same scenario.

Zanzibar where Abdulrazak Gurna resided had had history that it was also part of the colonies. So, he had great effects on colonizers followed the footprints of his masters, and tended to settle his life in the USA. The characters are represented in the characters of Salih and Latif who want to settle their lives in colonizers. There are some stages when colonizers colonize a country and then captured countries try to overthrow the throne and retaliate in different ways.

Firstly they want to directly retaliate against the colonizers and overthrow them but the colonizers are more powerful and they cannot do so. As a result, they adopt another of getting engaged with one another and start fighting in their community. In the end colonized cannot withhold resistance and follow the colonizers. The above discussion means that colonizers disturb the mentality of the colonizers and make them slaves forever. The two characters are the caricature of the author.

Adopting English Language

In the above discussion it is made clear that colonizers affect the cultures of the colonized and language is part of the culture. The language of the powerful overflows the language of the colonized and makes them molded. They reflect and adopt the attitudes of them. Taking the sweeping statements to the case of Abdulrazak Gurna that he has received fame in writing English and being praised by the colonizers makes him more motivated to write more. But he is accepting the colonizers and overthrowing his language

Reflection of the Title *By The Sea*

It has been mentioned in the methodology of the research that we are going for the analysis of the text. We take words as a metaphor. So the title of the book is too metaphorical. The sea is

taken as a metaphor for power. It is wide, overflowing, and powerful. The two characters meet on the side of the sea and seek stability. Metaphorically, the two characters are reflected as dependent on the sea (colonizers).

Disfiguring Colonized Identity Reverses Back

Colonizers attempt to disfigure the identity of the exotics or natives of the captivated land. For this purpose, the colonizers go for epistemic violence. Epistemic violence is done through the introduction of biased discourses against them. As earlier said oppression and suppression do not go away but it gets back. Applying this discussion to the novel called of Abdulrazak Gurna *By The Sea*. The protagonist of the novel, Salih Omar is trying to enter the USA in the wrong way. He named himself Rajab Shaban but Rajab Shaban was another character in the novel. He uses a fake passport to enter the USA.

They stole their identity, and as a response, he steals his identity and try to get into the country (USA). Colonizers usually get into the country via a backdoor. The character described in the novel is resistive and responsive to the state. The retaliation is more or less but it is the reactionary attempt of colonized. Their ego, their stubbornness does not go away but it converts into a revengeful character.

Decolonization

Decolonization is the act of overthrowing colonial power. It is setting free of colonizers from the subjugation of master. Decolonization is not an absolute term like taking off the veil but showing some sort of attitude towards colonizers. Now in the context of the novel it is reflected that Salih Omar is the character who is eligible to go to the USA through proper channels but he hides his identity, changes his name, claiming asylum. The most important element that is reflected in the novel is supposing that I do not know English. English is the language of exotics therefore, he knowingly ignores the English language.

The novel is visionary

The illegal flow of colonized to the USA is evident proof that it is the prediction of the predicament that it might be chance of the colonized community to overflow the colonizers in the future. The character belongs to East African Island which has been part of the colonies. There is also the predicament of refugees in the wake of the movement. More people will be migrated to the European countries.

Psychopathological study of the novel

It is repeatedly said colonialism has had long-term repercussions on the lifestyle of the colonized. The oppression posed by them makes them aggressive and somewhat terrorists. The foregoing statements have a rich background for the character 'Rajab Shaban Mehmud who turns into a scoundrel. Turning scoundrel is caused by the oppression shed by colonizers. The character Latif goes to the UK in a circuitous way. It is the emblem of criminal emergence.

Terrorism is a social construct

Terrorism is a socially, linguistically, and culturally constructed phenomenon. Terrorism is created and affects society in every aspect. The above character is the proof of social construction of terrorism. The character was not a terrorist but it was made or turned into a terrorist. Global peace is not an isolated thing to be taken or attributed to one country but it is our shared property. Oppression of one country's citizens is a preparation of weapons that destroy the peace of the rest of the world.

Illegal Transboundary migration

Salih Omar is trying to cross the boundaries illegally and Latif is trying to go to the UK in a circuitous way. Moving beyond the limit is included in the circumference of extremism.

Extremism and terrorism are two related terms that carry the same concept that it is deliberately created but it is proliferating at an alarming rate. These are all repercussions of the colonial power.

To conclude the above discussion it is stated that the novel has penetrated the themes containing the autobiography of the writer Abdulrazak Gurna. How he went to the UK and his life history. In the same way, colonialism has long-term impacts like revenge, psychological issues, terrorism, extremism, and many more. Colonial power creates identity flux with epistemology which in return gives birth to all of the above.

FINDINGS

- The study reveals that *By The Sea* incorporates autobiographical aspects of Abdulrazak Gurnah's life. Characters like Salih and Latif reflect Gurnah's personal experiences of displacement and the search for stability after migrating to the West. This finding directly answers the research question about the autobiographical elements in the novel.
- The novel illustrates the enduring effects of colonialism, such as identity crises, psychological trauma, and a sense of displacement. These are portrayed through characters like Salih, who uses a false identity to enter the UK. This finding addresses the research question of how colonialism's aftermath is depicted in the novel.
- The research shows that colonialism has significantly influenced language and cultural identity. Characters in the novel, including Gurnah, adopt English and distance themselves from their native languages, reflecting the impact of colonization on cultural identity. This finding aligns with the research question on the effects of colonialism on language and culture.
- The study suggests that terrorism and extremism in the novel are depicted as responses to colonial oppression. Characters' criminal activities and illegal migration are seen as consequences of the deep psychological scars left by colonial rule. This finding relates to the research question about the connection between colonialism and the rise of terrorism.
- The sea in the novel symbolizes power and the pervasive influence of the colonizers. The characters' reliance on the sea reflects their continued subjugation and struggle for stability, addressing the research question about the symbolic significance of the sea in the narrative.
- The novel portrays acts of resistance against colonial oppression, as characters navigate and challenge the systems that suppress them. This finding answers the research question concerning the theme of decolonization in the novel.
- The research concludes that *By The Sea* anticipates future migration trends and the ongoing struggles of post-colonial societies. This finding directly relates to the research questions about the visionary elements in the novel.

CONCLUSION

This chapter concludes the aforementioned discussion and analysis done by the researcher. The novel has imbibed multiple themes but this study has been carried out for two greater themes: autobiographic elements in the novel and the repercussions of colonialism. The novel has a protagonist Salih Omar who is the representative of the author. He deliberately changes his identity and wants to settle his life in the UK. The other aspect of the study is the consequences of colonialism. Colonial power tends to bring about drastic changes in the atmosphere of natives and call them different names like exotics and subalterns. This tagging affects the natives badly and has had long-term impacts on the colonized. It gives birth to terrorism, extremism, and illegal transmigration of the masses which proves itself destructive for global peace.

REFERENCES

Asher,k (2013)*Latin American decolonial thought, or making the subaltern speak*.Compass Journal, 7 (12),1-2.

Bressler, C. E. (2003).*An introduction to theory and practice* . New York: Pearson.

Carted, D. (2006) *Literary theories*, Pocket Essentials: Great Britains.

Barry, P. (2002) *Beginning theory*, Oxford university press: London.

Jamadhhade, D.S. (2014) *The subaltern writings in India: An overview of Dalit literature*.The Criterion An International Journal in English, 3 (5),1-2.

Lan, P.K. (2021).Modern theology.*The criterion*, 37 (4), 1-2.

Lather, P. (1986).*Research as praxis*. Harvard Educational Review,56(3), 257 277.<https://doi.org/10.17763/haer.56.3.bj2h231877069482>

Mahsud,N.H.K.,Ahmad,M.S.,&Wasai.(2021).Frontiercrimesregulation(FCR):fromintroduction to abolition.Global Political ReviewVI(I), 109-120

Mackenzie, N.&Knipe, S. (2006). *Research dilemmas: paradigms, methods and methodology*. Issues In Educational Research, 16, 1-15.

Spivak, G. C. (2010).*Can the subaltern speak?* New York: Colombia University Press.

STANDS4 LLC, (2022).Symbols.Retrieved from,<https://www.symbols.com/symbol/onion>

Valk, I. V. (2003).*Racism a threat to global peace*. International Peace Journal.8 (2),45-66.<https://www.jstor.org/stable/41852901>

Fisher, D., & Frey, N. (2012). Close Reading in Elementary Schools. *The Reading Teacher*, 66(3), 179-188.