



The Shifting Positions of Enunciation: Exploring the Tripartite Cultural Presences in Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*

Maryam Nawaz

Lecturer of English, FG Girls Degree College Syeda Fatima Campus, Lahore Cantt

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:

Enunciation, Cultural Identity, African Presence, European Presence, American Presence, Caribbean Identity

Corresponding Author:

Maryam Nawaz

Lecturer of English, FG Girls Degree College Syeda Fatima Campus, Lahore Cantt

Email:

muryam.nawaz160@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The given study explores Hall's concept of tripartite presences, which shape Caribbean identities and influence the characters' positions of enunciation in Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. The research traces the predominance of these presences in the cultural identity of three Caribbean women: Hortense, Clara, and Irie. The study elucidates how these three presences shape the positions of enunciation of Caribbean individuals while shaping their identities and positions of enunciation. The study further explores the manifestation of hybridity and its eventual rejection or acceptance by Caribbean women of different generations. The research argues that the older generation is less open to assimilation and hybridity by clinging more to the African presence of their cultural identity. Meanwhile, the younger generations reluctantly embrace multiculturalism by allowing the dominance of European and American presences in their cultural identities. The research explores the gradual shift in positions of enunciation of the three characters, exploring the fluid nature of their identities. The research concludes that the dominance of each presence shapes the worldview of each character, reasserting Hall's concept of identity in production, which is never complete but ever-evolving. These presences ultimately set their positions of enunciation through which they understand and interact with the world.

1. INTRODUCTION

Positions of enunciation are the precursors of cultural identities, embedded within personal and collective consciousness, while shaping an individual's worldview. The position of enunciation springs out of an individual's social and historical contexts and impacts the way they see and interact with the world. Smith in *White Teeth* sketches a "brave new multicultural world" with characters from various ethnic and cultural backgrounds (Nichols, 2001), where characters

navigate a hybrid environment through their respective lens of evolving identities. Focusing on Caribbean characters in the novel, Hall's three presences appear profoundly important in exploring the novel. Hall proposes three different presences that shape Caribbean diasporic identities, including African, European, and American, that ultimately forge Caribbean positions of enunciation (Hall, 2006). These three presences are meticulously explored in the current study through the lives of female Caribbean characters in Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. According to Moss, *White Teeth* showcases the unforeseen consequences of colonization, which appeared in the form of "cross-fertilization and eventual hybridization" (2003), shaped profoundly by the cultural interactions of immigrants. In this regard, *White Teeth* reflects the evolving African positions of enunciation, which are guided by different presences of their identity. The research traces the trajectory of the evolution of the tripartite presences in three successive Caribbean generations and studies the continuous production of their cultural identities. The research further explores the ruptures and continuities in the cultural identities of three female Caribbean characters: Hortense Bowden, Clara Bowden, and Irie Jones. The three characters represent different generations, each struggling varying in their respective diasporic contexts. In Hortense's character, one can observe the dominance of the African presence against the backdrop of her strong Jamaican roots and religious devotion. The intensity of Jamaican heritage visibly tones down in the next generation, represented by Clara, who struggles with a predominance of European presence. The study further explores how the impact of heterogeneity and multiculturalism is the strongest in the youngest generation, represented by Irie Jones. For Irie, cultural identity is a synthesis of American presence, characterized by hybridity and multiculturalism.

2. Theoretical Framework

The given research examines the positions of enunciation articulated by Stuart Hall in his seminal work, "Cultural Identity and Diaspora," as well as in Zadie Smith's novel, "White Teeth." Hall states that the "positions of enunciation... always implicate the positions from which we speak or write" (Hall, 2015). In other words, the positions of enunciation refer to the particular standpoints and specific historical, political, and cultural contexts through which individuals speak or write. These positions are the determining forces of what an individual articulates and how others receive it. For Hall, identity is "enunciated", meaning it is communicated through a particular set of contexts imbued in the speaker's position within the power structures and cultural contexts. These positions are shaped by a myriad of historical, cultural, and political factors, making them inherently collective and personal. Hall gives the example of the Caribbean position of enunciation, which cannot be articulated without reference to colonization, slavery, political subjugation, and migration.

According to Hall, the Caribbean identity is "positioned" with at least three presences, which include: "Presence Africaine, Presence Europeenne, and the third, most ambiguous, presence of all - the sliding term, Presence Americain" (Hall, 2015). The tripartite "presences" fashion Caribbean identities while framing their positions of enunciation through many related factors, including political and historical contexts. Hall further exclaims that each presence is a contributing factor to the overarching Caribbean identity of an individual. For Hall, each presence is not merely a historical fact but an enduring and powerful influence that permeates Caribbean consciousness, shaping their identity. The increasingly profound impact is that of the "Presence Africaine" which is one of the most multifaceted aspects of the Caribbean culture. Hall argues, "Presence Africaine is the site of the repressed...It is 'hiding' behind every verbal inflection, every narrative twist of Caribbean cultural life. It is the secret code with which every

Western text was 're-read'. It is the ground bass of every rhythm and bodily movement. This was -is - the 'Africa' that 'is alive and well in the diaspora" (Hall, 250, p. 230). Hall further argues that the Africaine presence remained pervasive despite its historically silenced voice, embedding the everyday life of Jamaicans with African beliefs, customs, arts, music, and storytelling. Since Zadie Smith was a Jamaican herself, the intricate web of various presences in the novel is also embedded in her own Jamaican identity, further defining the circular path of discovery and rediscovery of Caribbean positions of enunciation.

The second presence that shapes Caribbean positions of enunciation is the European Presence, the ever-present and omniscient factor in shaping Caribbean identities. According to Hall, European presence brings into question the power dynamics by disrupting the simple discourse of cultural questions. European presence, according to Hall, "is about exclusion, imposition and expropriation, we are often tempted to locate that power as wholly external to us - an extrinsic force...(contrastingly) this power has become a constitutive element in our own identities". Hall further argues that the European presence has manifested itself in Caribbean identity through a history of colonialism, exclusion, discrimination, racial oppression, and poverty, making it a "site of a profound splitting and doubling" (Hall, 2015, p. 233). In other words, European presence marks shifts and ruptures in Caribbean identity, giving birth to a complex ambivalence in Caribbean identities. For Hall (2015), to address the ever-present ambivalence caused by the European presence, it is pertinent to engage in a dialogue of power and resistance alongside "recognizing its irreversible influence, whilst resisting its imperializing eye". In the context of European presence, the given research traces the imperial gaze in Smith's novel *White Teeth*, particularly in the development of Clara Bowden's character, understanding its role in shaping and shifting the positions of enunciation of various characters in the said novel.

The third presence, Presence Americaine, is a "juncture-point" for Hall, which acts as a site of confluence of various migrations and cultural interactions that have created a unique space of hybridity and diversity. According to Hall, "The New World is the third term - the primal scene where the fateful/fatal encounter was staged between Africa and the West... The 'New World' presence... is therefore itself the beginning of diaspora, of diversity, of hybridity and difference, what makes Afro-Caribbean people already people of a diaspora" (Hall, 2015, p. 235). In this context, the given research argues that understanding this presence is pertinent to understanding the Caribbean identity in a broader dynamic interplay of culture, power, and history. The given research delves into the tripartite presences framing Caribbean identities and shaping the positions of enunciation of Caribbean women in Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*, acknowledging the multiple influences that shape Caribbean identities through memory, resistance, diversity, and cultural forces.

3. Literature Review

Zadie Smith's debut novel, *White Teeth*, depicts a vibrantly multicultural and hybrid London, illustrating the nuances of a multiethnic land. However, as Moss argues, Smith does not portray heterogeneity as an extraordinary phenomenon in the novel's plot. Instead, Smith tackles multiculturalism as an everyday experience, depicted through normal interactions between different characters in the novel. Moss (2003) argues that *White Teeth* "is not an outright celebration of hybridity, but nor is it a denunciation of the processes that have led to the existence of such hybridity. Instead, Smith is part of a generation of writers who have written about hybridity - racial, cultural, and linguistic-as part of the practice of everyday life". Further, according to Moss, the assumption that *White Teeth* addresses post-postcolonial themes misrepresents the novel's true essence. As Moss argues, contrary to the popular tenets of post-

post-colonialism, which defy historical narratives, *White Teeth* is full of historical anecdotes suggesting a profound impact of historical influences on an individual's identity. From Mangal Pandey's history to the fall of the Berlin Wall, Smith employs collective and personal historical events to shape the characters' present, showcasing that the past continues to influence the present and future of an individual (Moss, 2003). In this manner, Smith rejects the idea that present realities could ever be free from historical contexts, asserting that "history is inescapable". Moss uses Bhabha's concept of hybridity to explore the heterogeneity and rich cultural tapestry in the novel *White Teeth*, rightly arguing that the older generation is more rooted in fixed identities of binaries. Moss argues that in comparison, the young characters in the novel navigate the complexities of heterogeneity more effectively and embrace hybrid identities with more ease and acceptance. Moss's idea is further explored in the current study by exploring the tripartite presences in Caribbean identities of different generations in *White Teeth*. In short, by presenting hybridity as an ordinary phenomenon, Smith encourages readers to consider hybridity as a part of mundane life, thus leading to a more nuanced understanding of multi-stranded identities. However, Moss's interpretation of hybridity as an everyday experience in *White Teeth* appears to be too simplistic. Although Smith portrays multiculturalism as a dominant aspect of the characters' lives, each character suffers from the issues a typical hybrid community offers. It is not a mundane, day-to-day experience but an identical crisis for characters like Hortense and Samad.

The novel *White Teeth* is richly embedded with multiculturalism, generational trauma, historical narratives, hybrid identities, and other nuanced themes. To gain a deeper and more meticulous understanding of the novel, O'Grady (2002) conducts a thorough and insightful interview with the author of *White Teeth*, Zadie Smith. The interview covers various complexities of the said novel, including the themes of multiculturalism and generational trauma, challenges faced by the writer as a young author, diasporic identities, and the narrative techniques employed in the novel. When asked about the witty construction of the novel and the ambiguous identities of its characters, the author states, "[White Teeth] is about people who are obsessed and who build a kind of world which is entirely rational to them" (O'Grady, 2002). The writer further reveals her acute awareness of the deep historical impact of historical backgrounds on contemporary identities, particularly those of the diasporic communities living in the West. Smith compares historical and collective traumas to personal traumas that shape the overall identities of an individual and a society. She argues, "For people from the East every person is their family. I think that is how immigrants feel. And it might seem irrational or fundamentalist to other people but it feels like "everything is in everything else" (O'Grady, 2002, p. 106). In addition, Smith criticizes the notion that the discovery of one's roots leads to an unequivocal sense of newly forged identity. Smith argues, "Roots come with baggage. And the baggage isn't always fun". The comment showcases the author's profound understanding of immigrant experiences as she does not romanticize cultural identity but considers it a burden to be carried. Smith's reflections on the novel provide a useful framework for understanding the rich tapestry of multicultural characterization of the novel and the complex web of modern narratives.

Zadie Smith utilizes the concept of creolization in her novel *White Teeth* to showcase that the process is not just relevant to Caribbean culture but can be used globally to improve intercultural harmony. Thomas (2009) in the research article "Reading White Teeth to Improve Intercultural Communication" studies the novel through the lens of creolization theory, suggesting that Smith critiques the misrepresentations of Caribbean cultural practices in Western societies, particularly the process of creolization. Smith offers an alternative view on creolization arguing that properly

applying the concept of creolization can work as a harbinger of intercultural communication to foster a healthy hybrid community. Thomas draws upon Edouard Glissant's theory of creolization and opines, "To be creolized is not to abandon values or beliefs; it is simply viewing other practices as valid to foster intercultural communication." (Thomas, 2009). The research explores the process of assimilation and creolization to analyze characters and themes in *White Teeth*. The researcher opines that where assimilation has historically been used as a tool of domination by erasing cultural differences and creating a homogeneous society, creolization has the ability to be a unifying force between different cultures. Thomas further states that the character of Magid in *White Teeth* acts as a mouthpiece of creolization by promoting cultural unity and adopting diversity. Magid symbolizes the inclusive ability of creolization in a multicultural environment, where embracing differences does not imply domination of one culture over the other. Thomas (2009) states, "Multiple identities are indicative of the modern-day human experience, and the narrator attempts to display through Magid that any attempts to avoid this by elevating a specific cultural practice to a higher status causes societal progress to go static" (p. 26). Thomas concludes that the novel *White Teeth* offers a tool to improve intercultural communication through the process of creolization. The researcher further adds that creolization must not be seen merely as a historical phenomenon but as an interpretative framework to appreciate the complexities of multiculturalism.

Zadie Smith's *White Teeth* draws on social and cultural histories to shape the migrant experiences of characters. Dyer (2004) argues that the novel employs historiography to transform and reflect the voices of migrants from the 1950s. The researcher compares and contrasts the differences in identity formation of the original migrants from the 1950s to their descendants living in multicultural London. The author reiterates the lasting influence of colonialism on contemporary society by tracing the characters' struggle with finding their identity and navigating through a heterogeneous society. Dyer compares the characters of Samad and Irie, asserting that where Samad feels entrapped for life in an alien culture, Irie finds freedom in a multicultural landscape. The researcher employs postcolonial theory to study the novel *White Teeth* and *Yardie* and trace the evolution of their identity against the background of the imperial history of the British. In addition, Dyer (2004) studies how the events from history, such as the mutiny of 1857, are used by the author to engage with the themes of cultural memory and historiography. Dyer argues that Smith uses her characters' engagement with public memory and historical narratives to critique how history is portrayed and narrated. For example, Samad Iqbal's affiliation with mutiny leader Mangel Pandey represents the deep colonial fissures that the character struggles with while living an immigrant's life in London. The researcher states, "In *White Teeth*, Smith concerns herself and her characters not only with rehashing the 'Mutiny' and deciding who should or should not be memorialized as heroes of that bloody revolt; she also situates her characters within a new urban site, where that debate is kept alive for a character's personal, familial reasons" (p. 92). The researcher concludes that the novel *White Teeth* echoes migrant experiences from 1950s London by addressing the themes of generational trauma, cultural memory, creolization, and historiography.

Smith does not celebrate multiculturalism in her novel *White Teeth*; instead, she unveils the intricacies and complexities of hybridity in a post-colonial environment. Rogers (2008) argues that Smith uses the satirical lens to present a nuanced view of cosmopolitan London defined by the multicultural existence of various groups. As Rogers states, "Smith creates in *White Teeth* a convincing critique of cosmopolitanism and other similar post-colonial perspectives on hybridity without resorting to cosmopolitanism's supposed opposite, patriotism" (2008, p. 45). The

research uses Timothy Brenna's critique of cosmopolitanism to argue that cosmopolitanism commodifies local cultures while maintaining Western hegemony. The idea is critically explored in Smith's *White Teeth* as the researcher argues that cosmopolitanism ideals can lead to the homogenization of cultures by compromising cultural diversity and suppressing non-Western identities. Rogers states that Smith critiques the "Happy Multicultural Land (as she) populates *White Teeth* with characters brimming with "hybridity": mixed backgrounds, a variety of religions, a subsequent generation of blended cultures (2008, p. 49). Unlike Thomas, who views Magid as a standard character for creolization, Rogers studies Magid through a satirical lens, opining that Smith highlights the shortcomings of cosmopolitanism through this character. At the same time, as Thomas agrees, Smith projects the themes of historiography to emphasize the importance of recognizing the delicacies and complexities of historical narratives and their roles in shaping individual lives. Rogers provides a comprehensive analysis of Zadie Smith's *White Teeth* by arguing against the simplistic interpretations of the novel. Rogers concludes that the novel is not simply a celebration of multicultural Western societies. Instead, the novel is a critique of ignoring the complexities of hybrid societies by advocating a nuanced and realistic understanding of the complex hybrid societies.

In light of the above-mentioned studies, the given research addresses two questions: Firstly, how do cultural roots influence the Caribbean positions of enunciation, shaping their experiences and cultural identities? Secondly, to what extent does change manifest in Caribbean individuals in response to hybridity, and what are the specific impacts observed across different generations?

4. Analysis:

Positions of enunciations of an individual are the guiding forces of their cultural identity, defining the historical and political contexts from which they speak. Hall posits, "What recent theories of enunciation suggest is that, though we speak, so to say 'in our own name', of ourselves and from our own experience, nevertheless who speaks, and the subject who is spoken of, are never identical, never exactly in the same place" (2015, p. 222). For Hall, the positions of enunciation keep shifting, which then work as building blocks of an individual's identity. Hall emphasizes that identity is not a fixed and static phenomenon but an ever-changing process defined through the positions of enunciation. The fluidity in positions of enunciation is observable in Smith's *White Teeth* as characters navigate their identities amidst a myriad of historical and cultural contexts. According to Ismail, the bases of identity converge and diverge on factors such as gender, religion, politics, history, nation, and various socio-economic conditions (Ismail, 2019). Similar convergences and divergences are seen in Smith's *White Teeth*, portraying a range of fluid identities, shaped by the shifting positions of enunciation. In Bentley's opinion, Smith embodies Hall's idea of 'Black' as a constructed category in his work *New Ethnicities*, further stating that "Smith's novel emphasizes that multiculturalism should accept a mixing of ethnicity identified at the level of the individual rather than the nation. In this model, each of us is multicultural, and by extension multiethnic" (2007, p. 496). Accordingly, to understand the individual Caribbean identities and their positions of enunciation, Hall suggests the existence of tripartite presences that create Caribbean identities. On this spectrum of Caribbean identities defined by the tripartite presence, each character reflects their unique position of enunciation.

4.1. Hortense: Representing The Older Generation's Position of Enunciation

Hortense holds a peculiar position on the spectrum of enunciation, which is guided by her strong roots in "Presence Africaine", characterized by the Caribbean culture and customs, as Smith states, "Because this is the other thing about immigrants... they cannot escape their history more

than you yourself can lose your shadow” (2000, p. 341). Accordingly, Hall’s notion that identity is constructed and not fixed is critical to understanding Hortense’s character in the novel *White Teeth*. Hortense carries a cultural identity deeply rooted in her Jamaican heritage and a feverish attachment to her religious beliefs. Not only does she refute the influence of other presences in her character, but Hortense clings strongly to the African presence to the extent of zealotry (Ali and Ibrahim, 2019). These aspects of her character form the core of her position of enunciation, the position from which she speaks and comprehends the world. Moss asserts that the strong influence of African presence in Hortense’s way of living reflects a forced union of Africa and Britain. The daughter of a white English officer, Captain Durham, posted in Jamaica, and his maid Ambrosia, Hortense embodies a “forced hybridity”, against which she reacts with a strong African presence in her position of enunciation. For instance, she haughtily states, “Black and white never come to no good. De Lord Jesus never meant us to mix it up... ‘Im want everybody to keep tings separate” (Smith, 2000, p. 282). Similarly, consider the extent of Hortense’s position of enunciation as a Jehovah’s Witness when she laments not seeing an apocalypse that would have destroyed all entire humanity. The narrator states, “The first morning of 1925, she has wept like a baby when she awoke to find- instead of hail and brimstone and universal destruction- the continuance of daily life, the regular running of the buses and trains... How bitterly she had been disappointed” (Smith, 2000, p. 26). Hortense’s character, in other words, is deeply influenced by her Jamaican roots, intertwined with a sense of agency that pushes back the colonial influences. In this regard, Hortense’s position of enunciation is guided by two axes of the African presence: religious fervor and denunciation of other presences.

According to Hall, the African presence is marked by the memory of slavery and the existence of Africa in everyday life. In Hall’s words,

"Africa was, in fact present everywhere: in the everyday life and customs of the slave quarters, in the languages and patois of the plantations, in names and words, often disconnected from their taxonomies, in the secret syntactical structures through which other languages were spoken, in the stories and tales told to children, in religious practices and beliefs, in the spiritual life, the arts, crafts, musics and rhythms of slave and post-emancipation society. Africa, the signified which could not be represented directly in slavery, remained and remains the unspoken, unspeakable 'presence' in Caribbean culture” (Smith, 2000, p. 230).

This memory of Africa works more intensely in marking the positions of enunciation in the older generation of the Caribbean culture. Unlike other younger Caribbean characters who are more inclined toward other presences, Hortense’s character is deeply shaped by her African descent. The intensity of the presence can be observed in Hortense’s despise for other cultures, even for African non-Jehovah’s Witnesses. For Hortense, this African presence is integral to her identity, which is visible in her spiritual practices, manner of speech, adherence to traditional norms, and overall worldview that originates from her African descent, albeit filtered through her religious beliefs as a Jehovah’s Witness. This unique syncretism can be observed when Clara asks Hortense about the fate of Non-Jehova’s Witnesses, upon which the narrator narrates, “Some people, Hortense asserted with a snort, have done such a hol’ heap of sinning, it late for dem to be making eyes at Jehova. It takes effort to be close to Jehova” (Smith, 2000, p. 24). It can be argued that Hortense’s character is shaped by her experiences as an immigrant, an African, and a practicing Jehovah’s Witness.

Additionally, Hortense’s manner of speech, a direct illustration of her position of enunciation, is a corollary of the stark African presence in her character. For example, when Hortense talks about her miracle birth in the middle of the Kingston earthquake, the narrator exclaims, “She

liked to say: ‘Bein’ barn is de hardest part! Once ya done dat – no problems.’” (p. 27). Hortense uses Jamaican patois, defined by the Jamaican Patois Website as “an English-lexified creole language spoken by the majority of Jamaicans”. The Jamaican patois used by Hortense in the heart of the British Empire, London, exemplifies the strong Jamaican roots in her character. The phonological variations in the given phrase include “bein” for “being”, and “barn” for “born”, which shows dropping the sound of “g” in gerunds, along with “de” for “the” and “dat” for “that”, which showcase common vowel substitutions and consonant changes in patois. In addition, a more direct syntactical structure of the phrase and the vocabulary (for example, “ya” instead of “you”) further highlights deviation from standard English language protocols. In other words, the use of language by Hortense and her manner of speech serve as markers of her position of enunciation, which are reinforced through her cultural background, religious beliefs, and Jamaican descent. Nonetheless, the existence of other presences and their influences on Hortense’s character cannot be ignored. Although strongly shaped by African presence, other presences, including European and American play their role in the formation of Hortense’s position of enunciation. According to Bergholitz, Hortense’s Caribbean affiliations are “incompatible” with the ambiguity of a pluralistic society (p. 541). Hortense therefore resists the ambiguity originating from European and American presences in her cultural identity, so she strongly clings to her African roots, becoming a unique amalgam of religious fervor and Jamaican descent.

In short, Hortense’s character is a manifestation of a dominant African presence, which, in Hall’s argument, reflects the dynamic and multifaceted nature of diasporic identities. Hortense’s character is an enduring testament to a nuanced African position of enunciation in a diasporic community, even when such a position is reconstituted under various contexts. As Hall asserts, “This was -is - the 'Africa' that 'is alive and well in the diaspora” (2015, p. 230). Through Hortense’s character, Smith sketches a vivid portrayal of complex African positions of enunciation shaped through diasporic experiences and constantly redefined through representation and cultural identities.

4.2. Clara Bowden’s Position of Enunciation: A Pre-Dominance of European Presence

Zadie Smith portrays characters from each generation in a vividly different position of enunciation based on their social and historical contexts. According to Moss, where the older generation is more rooted in their African roots, the younger generations gradually drift away from their ancestral heritage. In this regard, in contrast to her mother, Hortense Bowden, there is a drift from African presence toward European presence in Clara Bowden’s character, who, after migrating to London, adopts duality in her positions of enunciation. Trimm (2015) opines that “Clara is a product of British schools” (p. 160), thus giving way to the European presence in her position of enunciation. As Moss states, “The older generation of characters is most upset by the very ordinariness of the children's integration into a multiplicitous landscape. They remain in-between two notions of home” (2015, p. 14). The two notions of the home serve as a defining feature of Hall’s “Presence Europeenne”. According to Hall, European presence is the site of power and resistance, along with a sense of ambivalence caused by the disproportionate sense of belonging to two places (2015, p. 233). Therefore, the positions of enunciation emerging from a predominantly European presence are ambivalent in nature. Bhabha (2012) explains this ambivalence in his seminal work *The Location of Culture*, stating, “the ambivalence... fixes the colonial subject as a ‘partial’ presence... both incomplete and virtual” (p. 86). Smith creates

ambivalence in Clara's character through her transition from a Jamaican identity to a European one.

According to Hall, "Identity... belongs to the future as much as to the past" (2015, p. 225). In Clara's case, both the future and past are the primary vectors of her position of enunciation. Born to Hortense Bowden, a true Jehovah's Witness, Clara's early life is marked by deep religious affiliations. However, as she moves to England, she marries Archie Jones, a white Englishman, signifying a major shift from the predominant African existence. Clara speaks and comprehends the world from an ambivalent position, an African and a European at the same time. This ambivalent space is a result of Clara's continuous effort to get assimilated into British society. This assimilation is reflective of European presence, which Hall deems as a dominant force in diasporic communities. According to Hall,

"The dialogue of power and resistance, of refusal and recognition, with and against Presence Europeenne is almost as complex as the 'dialogue' with Africa. In terms of popular cultural life, it is nowhere to be found in its pure, pristine state. It is always-already fused, syncretised, with other cultural elements. It is always-already creolised - not ever-present... traversing and intersecting our lives at every point" (Hall, 2015, p. 233).

The "traversing and intersecting" position of enunciation in Clara's case is evident in her marriage with Archie Jones, which relocates her quite literally to the social and cultural milieu of European ways of life. Clara's marriage signifies a shift in her cultural identity, which Hall asserts shapes the position of enunciation. In addition, much to her mother's chagrin, Clara forgoes her previous life as a devout Jehovah's Witness by adopting European norms and values. This transition, away from her fanatically devout mother, Hortense, signifies the predominance of European presence in Clara Bowden's position of enunciation. Previously governed by the African presence, Clara now speaks and understands the world from a European lens, which Hall asserts to be characterized by duality, ambivalence, and creolization.

The intersection of "refusal and recognition" is further evident in the shift in Clara's religious practices and worldviews resulting from the continuous negotiation between her Jamaican roots and her new European life. The negotiation is not straightforward; instead, it is ambiguous and indirect, involving significant moments of tension and conflict. The ambiguity in this negotiation can be observed in the evolution of Clara's character from teenage to adulthood. The narrator previously refers to Clara as "For Clara was not like other teenagers. She was the Lord's child. Hortense's miracle baby" (Smith, 2000, p. 27). However, when in the later part of her life, Archie refers to the miraculous birth of Hortense and Clara as a sign of "toughness", the narrator states, 'Not toughness, said Clara quietly, standing up to look through the broken window at the chaos outside, luck. Luck and faith.' (p. 169). This shift in Clara's position of enunciation springs out of her ambivalent identity, dominated by European presence. The transition from "miracle baby" to the vague amalgam of "luck and faith" marks the profound discontinuities and ruptures inherent in Caribbean diasporic communities. In other words, Clara's character embodies Hall's notion of discontinuous identity formation and the ambivalence in positions of enunciation of the Caribbean diaspora, predominated by European presence.

4.3. Irie Jones: An Embodiment of Presence Americaine

Identities are never static; they keep changing; they are a "matter of becoming as well as being" (Hall, 2015, p. 225). In Hall's opinion, identity is a product of multitudes of cultural influences and social contexts. This identity, which Hall further asserts, is the name "we give to the different ways we are positioned by, and position ourselves within, the narratives of the past" (p. 225). In this regard, Irie Jones in Smith's Novel *White Teeth* serves as a compelling example of

how Caribbean positions of enunciation can be shaped and molded by a hybrid sense of self. Accordingly, among the three presences outlined by Hall- African, European, and American Presences, Irie Jones's character embodies American presence. The dominance of American presence is observed in Irie Jones' rejection of monolithic identity in favor of multiculturalism, reinforced by her hybrid surroundings.

The American presence is explained by Hall as, "The 'New World' presence... is itself the beginning of diaspora, of diversity, of hybridity and difference by the recognition of a necessary heterogeneity and diversity; by a conception of 'identity' which lives with and through, not despite, difference; by hybridity" (Hall, 2015). Irie's position of enunciation is shaped by her African-European heritage; her mother, Clara of African descent, and her father, Archie Jones, who represents a traditional English background. Similarly, the strong Caribbean beliefs of her grandmother, Hortense, further shape her character. In McMann's view, Irie's grandmother, Hortense, and her rigid cultural beliefs are the biggest "stumbling block" in Irie's path to being completely British (2012). The mixed heritage of Irie puts her at the intersection of multiple cultural narratives, making her a living embodiment of a hybrid American presence. However, along with hybridity, strangeness is another defining feature of the American presence. As Hall (2015) puts it, the American presence is "where strangers from every other part of the globe collided" (p. 234). Accordingly, the narrator reflects on this alienated feeling of Irie as "Irie didn't know she was fine. There was England, a gigantic mirror, and there was Irie, without reflection. A stranger in a stranger land" (Smith, 2000, p. 197). As a "stranger", Irie experiences the ruptures and alienation that reflect the broader cultural tensions juxtaposed by her mixed heritage. Hall narrates, "Presence Americaine continues to have its silences, its suppressions". These silences and suppressions appear even starker when the narrator states Irie's continuous "nightmares and daydreams", preoccupied with her thoughts of transformation from an "hourglass Jamaican" to an "English Rose" who is a "slender delicate thing not made for the hot suns" (p. 197). McMann (2012) sees Irie's struggle with her racialized body as a "struggle against her very DNA" (p. 619) as she attempts to make the impossible happen by conforming her African body to the Willowy British beauty (O'Grady, 2002). This inferiority, as Frantz Fanon (2016) would agree, arises from the internalization of the colonizer's beliefs and ideals, which lead the colonial subjects to mimic their masters.

Regardless of the silences and suppressions of the American presence, Irie Jones continues to navigate her complex position of enunciation dominated by the American presence. The hybridity and dynamicity of her character emerge even more profoundly when Irie gives birth to a mixed-race daughter, who is then adopted by Joshua, a product of a multicultural progressive environment. The fact that Irie is dubious about the real father of the child further showcases the discontinuities and ruptures that govern her identity. This child's lineage fuses Jamaican, Bangladeshi, and British roots, further reinforcing the dominance of the American presence in Irie's character. The hybrid existence, straddling multiple cultural and ethnic lines, further reflects Hall's concept of dynamic and fluid diasporic identity. It can, therefore, be safely argued that Irie's position of enunciation is framed by the dominance of the American presence in her diasporic identity. Through Irie, Smith underscores the complexities in positions of enunciation of Caribbean diasporic communities, highlighting the ongoing cultural negotiation and synthesis that define their multicultural environment. Smith illustrates how identities are continuously framed not only through cultural experiences but an individual's social and historical contexts.

5. Conclusion

To conclude, Zadie Smith's novel *White Teeth* portrays a range of Caribbean cultural identities, varying distinctly from each other. Smith's novel embodies Hall's assertion that identities are in a continuous mode of production, ever-shifting and evolving through cultural interactions. From Hall's perspective, it can be argued that Smith inculcated a complex web of representations that guide the characters' positions of enunciation. The ways that these Caribbean characters speak and comprehend their environment are directly situated in their positions of enunciation. It is also interesting to note that the trajectory of the tripartite presences can be observed in three generations of female Caribbean characters, each adapting differently to the changing surroundings. Where the octogenarian Hortense Bowden clings to her African roots, her positions of enunciation are guided by the dominance of *Presence Africaine* in her cultural identity. At the same time, her daughter, Clara Bowden adopts ambivalence in her position of enunciation, emerging out of her Jamaican past and British future and, thus, dominated by the *Presence Européenne* in her cultural identity. Lastly, there is the young generation of the Caribbean diaspora, represented by Irie Jones. Irie's upbringing in a hybrid and multicultural community results in the dominance of *Presence Americaine* in her position of enunciation, as she sees the world from the lens of heterogeneity. Tracing this trajectory of varying presences, it can be concluded that younger generations adopt hybridity more easily as compared to their ancestors. The influence of heterogeneity is more intense on the younger generations who embrace hybridity in identity more openly as compared to their older generations. Depending upon their positions of enunciation, each generation views the world in varying manners. Where the younger generations approbate hybridity and shifts in their cultural affiliations, the older generations apprehend such shifts and react strongly against them. Nonetheless, in the efforts to embrace or resist these ruptures, the identities stay in the process of production and re-production.

6. REFERENCES

- Ali, B. W., & Ibrahim, J. (2019). The construction of identity in Zadie Smith's **White Teeth**. *Zanco Journal of Humanity Sciences*, 23(5), 330–342.
- Bentley, N. (2007). Re-writing Englishness: Imagining the nation in Julian Barnes's *England, England* and Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. *Textual Practice*, 21(3), 483–504.
- Bergholtz, B. (2016). "Certainty in its purest form": Globalization, fundamentalism, and narrative in Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. *Contemporary Literature*, 57(4), 541–568.
- Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The location of culture*. Routledge.
- Dyer, R. (2004). Generations of Black Londoners: Echoes of 1950s Caribbean migrants' voices in Victor Headley's *Yardie* and Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. *Obsidian*, 5(2), 81–102.
- Fanon, F. (2016). *Black skin, white masks*. In *Social theory re-wired* (pp. 394–401). Routledge.
- Hall, S. (2015). Cultural identity and diaspora. In *Colonial discourse and post-colonial theory* (pp. 392–403). Routledge.
- Hall, S. (2006). New ethnicities. In [Editor Information Needed] (pp. 453–462). Routledge.
- Jamaican Patwah. (2024, May 15). *Jamaican Patwah Dictionary*. <https://jamaicanpatwah.com/term/patois/1477>
- McMann, M. (2012). British Black Box: A return to race and science in Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 58(3), 616–636.
- Moss, L. (2003). The politics of everyday hybridity: Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. *Wasafiri*, 18(39), 11–17.
- Nichols, S. (2001). Biting off more than you can chew: Review of Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. *New Labor Forum*. Labor Resource Center, Queens College, City University of New York.

- O'Grady, K. (2000). The empire strikes back. *The Women's Review of Books*, 19–20.
- O'Grady, K. (2002). White Teeth: A conversation with author Zadie Smith. *Atlantis: Critical Studies in Gender, Culture & Social Justice*, 27(1), 105–111.
- Rogers, K. (2008). Affirming complexity: White Teeth and cosmopolitanism. *Interdisciplinary Literary Studies*, 9(2), 45–61.
- Thomas, M. (2009). Reading White Teeth to improve intercultural communication. *Journal of Caribbean Literatures*, 6(1), 15–30.
- Trimm, R. (2015). After the century of strangers: Hospitality and crashing in Zadie Smith's White Teeth. *Contemporary Literature*, 56(1), 145–172.